



Framingham Public Schools
Robert A. Tremblay, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools

SCHOOL COMMITTEE

Adam Freudberg, Chair • Gloria Pascual, Vice Chair • Tracey Bryant, Clerk
Noval Alexander • Geoffrey Epstein • Richard A. Finlay
Beverly Hugo • Tiffanie Maskell • Scott Wadland
Yvonne M. Spicer, Mayor
73 Mount Wayte Avenue, Second Floor, Framingham, MA 01702
Telephone: 508-626-9121 Fax: 508-877-4240

SCHOOL COMMITTEE: OPEN MEETING MINUTES

DATE AND TIME: October 2, 2019 at 7:00 p.m.

LOCATION: Memorial Building-Blumer Room
150 Concord Street, Framingham

MEETING CALLED BY: Chair Adam Freudberg

PRESENT: Noval Alexander
Tracey Bryant
Geoffrey Epstein
Richard A. Finlay
Adam Freudberg
Beverly Hugo
Tiffanie Maskell
Gloria Pascual
Scott Wadland
Mayor Yvonne Spicer

ABSENT: None

ALSO PRESENT: Dr. Robert Tremblay, Superintendent
Rose Bailey, Student Advisory Committee Member
Nicholas Smart, Chair of Student Advisory Committee
Anne Ludes, Assistant Superintendent of Secondary Education
Amy Bright, Assistant Superintendent of Elementary Education
Matthew Torti, Director of Building and Grounds
Lincoln Lynch, Executive Director of Finance and Operations

44 The Chair called the meeting to order at 7:02 p.m.

45

46 Call to Order

47 The Chair announced that this meeting was being broadcast live on local cable, as well as for
48 later playback, and on Facebook Live.

49

50 Public Comment

51 Christine Mulrone said that while some of the points on prepared lesson plans may seem
52 simple when explained in a theoretical video or question and answer format, the real bone of
53 contention currently is within the very prescriptive and time consuming specific type of lesson
54 planning. She said that despite characterization from the Superintendent as objections from
55 “FTA leadership”, the reality is that educators in every single elementary and secondary level
56 schools are finding this newly proposed process incredibly time consuming and counter-
57 productive to student learning. She said that parents are also standing in support of educators,
58 and seeing that this type of forced directed lesson planning is actually impeding teacher
59 connection with students, and adequate time for real planning and collaboration with other
60 educators in the best interest of students. She asked all those in the audience to stand up if
61 they are here to show opposition to the scripted lesson planning documents teachers are being
62 directed to utilize this year. She said that we all want equity and consistency of experience for
63 all students, as well as equitable access to high quality instruction, and for every single child to
64 succeed, but this is not the way to achieve this lottable goal.

65

66 Sabrina Gravanti said that a letter was posted to Source this morning with her name on it, the
67 person who wrote it wanted to remain anonymous and she felt that it was important to be
68 seen, so she posted it as the King FTA building representative. She said that this whole process
69 has spiraled into what feels like is a political exercise, and that it appears that Central Office
70 Administration is running a spin machine in an attempt to shape their messaging for public
71 consumption. She said that they are still left with the questions: what are we all doing here
72 and why are we all fighting for what we think is the right way to proceed? She said she would
73 hope we are doing it for the children, and to not lose sight of the fact that every single person
74 sitting here has chosen to work with children in some capacity. She said that these new
75 mandates are taking teachers focus away from the children; they now have less time to
76 collaborate and less time to have meaningful discussions about their students. She asked
77 where the research is showing that copying and pasting already written curriculum into a
78 template is benefitting students. She said that she urges the School Committee to please listen
79 to us, she said that Central Office Administration is painting a picture to make it seem that the
80 teachers are overreacting or just don’t want to do the work. She said that this couldn’t be
81 farther from the truth, and to listen to the educators as they are on the front line day in day out
82 working hard to meet the needs of every single child in their classroom and they know what is
83 best for our students.

84

85 Kathryn Thomas said she is speaking for the Special Education team at King, who she says are
86 scrambling to provide their students with accommodations and modifications, because they no
87 longer have the flexibility to discuss plans in the way that works for them. She said she has
88 coplanned with team members for years and they have always been able to think about what

89 their students need, and then design their lessons around their students. She said now there is
90 no time to do the work needed to differentiate the material in their classroom regardless of
91 special needs, ELL, or needs of other students. She said that when she meets now with general
92 education teachers they are overwhelmed and stressed, and their collaboration sessions are no
93 longer effective use of their time, because teachers are filling out the planners and have little
94 time to prepare the materials. She said that this makes their job as special educators more
95 stressful too, as they are now checking the teachers plans on Monday morning and quickly
96 pulling together the resources to make sure their students have what they need in order to
97 access the curriculum throughout the week. She said that she understands the end goal of
98 coplanning, and having lessons tied to the standards, but right now it is unattainable to
99 complete given the amount of time that they are given inside or outside their contractual work
100 hours. She said that the stress that it is putting on teachers when they are not in front of their
101 students is impacting the time they have with their students. She said she knows the School
102 Committee is aware of their concerns, but asks them to take a closer look at what is being
103 asked of Framingham teachers; see how it is impacting our students, as they want what is best
104 for our students.

105
106 Sarah McKeon said she is a teacher at Dunning and is here to speak on the topic of the
107 unreasonable demands being placed on the teachers, but would like to start by addressing the
108 condescending, patronizing posts on social media made by some community members. She
109 said that while some of you may diminish or deny their message, they are the ones living it
110 every day in their classrooms and buildings, they are the ones who see the direct effects, or lack
111 thereof, on their teaching. She said that this is not an issue at only one school or a cluster of
112 schools, it is a district wide problem. She said that she has considered conversations that
113 teachers engage in over why they teach, and the reasons listed do not include regurgitating
114 existing curriculum. She said that their curriculum does not belong in boxes, and neither do the
115 students or the teachers. She said that this is not whining or complaining, embellishment or
116 hysteria, this is a group of professionals addressing this audience repeatedly describing in detail
117 their concerns and experiences with these demands. She said she would be more worried
118 about so many of them looking for other jobs, rather than snidely remarking that they aren't
119 already doing the ones they have. She asked to please listen to us, let us teach blending in our
120 unique styles and experiences; we all have beautiful music to bring to the show, but only if you
121 stop denying us a place to play it.

122
123 Dr. Annie Fox said that she is a professor of quantitative methods and a Framingham parent,
124 and says that she thinks an entirely data driven educational philosophy strips teachers and
125 students of their humanity; they become data points with an underlying assumption that
126 teachers cannot be trusted. She said that instead of trusting the experts in the classroom FPS
127 leadership is choosing to trust the data, and the lesson plan mandate is one consequence of
128 this data driven philosophy. She said that this encourages, if not explicitly requires, teachers to
129 do the same thing on the same day. She said that the lesson plan mandates do not improve or
130 address quality of instruction, and said that FPS leadership has not cited any data or evidence
131 on its own about the effectiveness of this practice. She said that the evidence we do have
132 though is abundantly clear in the comments of the teachers who have repeatedly and
133 consistently stated that this mandate negatively affects the quality of their instruction. She said

134 that she originally chose King Elementary because it was heralded as a STEAM school that
135 promoted and encouraged project based learning, but beginning last year the mandated scope
136 and sequence of the district wide curriculum pushed out this innovation, and the King teachers
137 creativity and professionalism were disregarded in favor of a top down cookie cutter
138 curriculum. She said that her children's last year at King was qualitatively different than the
139 previous year. She said that she realized the reason they were excited to send their kids there-
140 teacher autonomy, project based learning, innovating teaching-no longer existed, and they
141 made the difficult decision to transfer their children out of FPS. She said that there teacher
142 collaboration is evident, on the other hand the most evident teacher traits here is burnout, and
143 she would encourage FPS leadership to look into the data on that. She said that equity of
144 experience across the district could be implemented in a thousand ways, but instead of inviting
145 teachers to the table at the outset, FPS chose a top down approach that leaves our teachers,
146 our most valuable source of meaningful data, with feelings of mistrust, disrespect and
147 exhaustion. She said that data is a tool that should inform policy, not dictate it. She said her
148 advice as a data scientist is to put aside the IReady minutes, the lockstep curriculum, the lesson
149 plan oversight, and to listen to the teachers; they have the data you need.

150

151 Beth Folsom spoke about her daughter's wonderful experience at Dunning, and for that she
152 gives credit to the amazing group of teachers who helped to shape her elementary years, not
153 only as a student, but also as an entire person. She particularly spoke about Colleen Gazard,
154 who got to know her daughter as an individual child, with a unique set of academic social and
155 emotional needs, and provided her child with a touchstone in a time of change. She said that
156 the most amazing thing of all is not that Ms. Gazard displayed this kind of care and dedication in
157 interacting with her daughter, it's that there are hundreds of Ms. Gazards in schools across the
158 City who are doing this every day for all of their students. She said that she was involved in the
159 interview process last spring as King sought new teachers, and it became even clearer to her
160 just how much is expected from our teachers. She said that these are men and women who
161 have gone through years of education and training, not only in respective grade levels and
162 subject areas, but also in differentiating instruction, accommodating a wide variety of learning
163 styles, collecting and analyzing feedback, and ensuring the social emotional health of children in
164 their care. She said that on any given day they are expected to do the work not only of an
165 instructor, but that of a psychologist, mediator, advocated, and cheerleader. She said let's treat
166 our teachers like the experienced and dedicated professionals they are; they care for our
167 children as if they were their own and in return we owe them the respect, trust, and autonomy
168 to know what the students with whom they have worked so hard to build relationships need in
169 order to thrive both in school and beyond.

170

171 Gerry Bloomfield said that there is trouble right here in Framingham-the school district. He
172 asked why have so many residents have lost confidence in the City Council, the Mayor and the
173 School Committee, and said that perhaps it is because they are not fully present; that they are
174 in their own silos, working on their own agenda, over their head, tone deaf, or arrogant. He
175 said that senior citizens are leaving Framingham, and families with school aged children are
176 moving in, and there is an overabundance of unplanned large apartment complexes that will
177 also house children. He said that we are not ready for children from third world countries with
178 Framingham as a destination, and we are actually importing foreign teachers, and asks don't we

179 have american teachers. He said that we have insufficient quality classrooms, and that we
180 know schools have to be replaced, and we are way behind, it's not just brick and mortar. He
181 said that we have a serious bussing crisis, have student delivery out of their neighborhood; not
182 simply just because there are too many students in one area and not enough school buildings,
183 but because of curriculum. He said that perhaps all like schools should have the same
184 standardized curriculum. He said that we have distressed teachers, upset parents, and well
185 intended school administrators, however something got lost in translation with lesson plans; all
186 changes are hard, there is a process for successful change - human nature and human relations
187 are key to accepting change. He asked where we are on vaping, other problems exist such as
188 edible marijuana, where are we on up to date policies stating detailed disciplinary
189 consequences showing absolute zero. He asked when and where will there be a formalized ten
190 to twenty year school building plan published. He said that lastly he recommends reading Why
191 Meadow Died and "How Children Learn Best".

192
193 Nancy Clougherty said that she is an ESL teacher at Woodrow Wilson, and is sharing once again
194 the concerns and experiences of teachers. She said she would like to clear up any
195 misconceptions - teachers work hard, have always worked hard and will continue to work hard,
196 not one of them is unwilling to put in hard work for our students and our school. She said that
197 teachers have been planning standards based engaging academic lessons with content and
198 language objectives for a long time; they have always assessed their students and used
199 formative and summative assessment data to track student learning, have adjusted their
200 practice, and grouped their students for optimal learning. She said that at issue here is the
201 directive that they have been given to complete a lesson template each week, by typing into
202 over 300 boxes, and one week in advance. She showed an example and said that this is not the
203 work of an overachieving teacher, it is what was shared with them by their principal as an
204 example of the work they are expected to submit each week. She said at the same time that
205 they have this added clerical work, they have lost most of their coplanning time. She said that
206 they do not have 275 minutes of preparation time per week as Dr. Tremblay has stated, at
207 Woodrow Wilson they have three 55 minutes blocks of prep time. She said that as a response
208 to the FTA's other grievance Dr. Tremblay has combined their previous five and ten minute
209 blocks, into one fifteen minute block, but she says this barely gives them enough time to get
210 back in their rooms, straighten up, turn on their computer and open documents. She said that
211 they have two additional team time meetings per week totalling 95 minutes, but until recently
212 they were not allowed to work on their planners during this time. She said that many of their
213 members feel like the time should be allowed to collaboratively plan their lessons as a grade
214 level team. She said that Dr. Tremblay talks about equity, yet he also refers to our schools as
215 Tier 1, Tier 2 and Tier 3, and it seems that he is dividing our schools and our teachers, but they
216 are not schools or teachers at Tier 1, 2 or 3, they are Framingham Public Schools and the
217 Framingham Teachers Association and they will not be divided.

218
219 Christina Fraggos has a son at King and she is here out of concern for the current state of the
220 Framingham Public Schools, as today is around the 20th day of school, and the teachers are
221 already feeling burnt out and near their breaking point. She said that it has not been the
222 easiest start to the school year; transportation has been a disaster, the kids are stuck indoors all
223 day due to EEE, and now teachers are crying out for help, though mostly in very quiet or even

224 anonymous voices because they fear possible repercussions. She said that this idea of forcing
225 teachers to complete daily lesson plans, and the idea that teachers across the City are supposed
226 to teach the same lessons on the same day, are both completely unreasonable. She said that
227 we have amazing teachers in Framingham; teachers who already spend a good deal of their
228 time outside of school preparing for lessons, studying and learning and supporting our kids in a
229 million different little ways, and yet the only response that she has seen so far from
230 Framingham has been through Facebook videos telling parents that you hear our concerns, and
231 you plan to have more meetings with teachers to discuss their concerns. She said that she is not
232 sure if she is more bothered by the whole idea of forcing additional administrative and
233 bureaucratic burdens on our already overworked and overpaid teachers, or the idea that
234 sending out a Facebook video is an adequate response. She said that our teachers deserve to
235 be heard, their concerns are valid and they are not simply complaining about having to do more
236 work. She said that it seems to her that these impositions are being put into place to make it
237 easier for the administration to track the work the teachers are doing, and at a higher level she
238 thinks this all has to do with MCAS, at least that is what the language in the FPS Strategic Plan
239 seems to indicate. She said that our students and our teachers are more than just numbers,
240 and they deserve to be treated better. She implores the School Committee to take action on
241 this concern; no more lip service about meetings and more talks, it is incumbent upon you to
242 make it better; to make our schools the best they can be if our amazing teachers get pushed
243 out by your bureaucracy than you are doing the opposite of what you are supposed to be
244 doing.

245
246 William LaBarge said he is a candidate for District 9 School Committee, and has some concerns
247 regarding being short bus drivers; he said that he hopes that is not an everyday thing, and if it is
248 he asks which bus routes are getting adversely affected. He said that a great number of
249 teachers are here complaining about being burnt out over having to enter lesson plans, and he
250 is wondering what benefit the school is currently getting from it, and would like to hear real
251 examples. He said that the Superintendent just got a six year contract, and does that mean the
252 teachers, bus drivers, even the janitors will be getting a similar six year contract, and if not,
253 does that mean their work in the school is that less valued. He said that he fears that the talk
254 on racial equality could be very well seen as platitute and nothing more. He said all of these
255 problems reflect onto all of us here, and if he is elected it will reflect on him as well. He said
256 that we have to hold somebody accountable, and the School Committee could start asking hard
257 questions with the school Superintendent, as the teachers take good care of our kids and he
258 would like to see the respect reciprocated.

259
260 The Chair said this is the time when they would split into two public comments sections due to
261 time, but he will let the five remaining speakers speak, and then begin the Superintendent's
262 Report where they were be discussion on some of these topics.

263
264 Kate Meyer said she was here to read a letter that was written by a group of parents at King
265 Elementary. She said that they are fortunate to have fantastic schools and wonderful teachers
266 who spend countless hours of their own time preparing for the days with our children and still
267 supporting and cheering on their students at games, shows, emailing concerned parents, and
268 attending as many events or fundraisers as they can. Framingham teachers are innovating,

269 creative, inspiring, well rounded, caring, intelligent and professional. She said that King has had
270 the distinct honor of leading the district with the initiative of STEAM learning, which means that
271 teachers are constantly thinking outside the box, approaching ideas in new ways and creatively
272 teaching each and every student. She said this means they are collaboratively working on
273 expanding and differentiating the arduous curriculum by connecting our students learning
274 experiences to STEAM principles, which makes them an incredible resource for teachers across
275 the district. She said that if you were to walk through the schools in Framingham you would
276 not feel the weight of the stressors that the teachers are facing, because they are doing their
277 part to support a positive school community giving their all each and every day. She said that
278 the reality is that we see the stress with the quantitative statistics of things like teacher
279 retention, recruitment, and class sizes along with letters being sent to social media outlets, and
280 interactions among community members on social media sites. She said that they want their
281 teachers to have whatever they need to be successful and help our children excel - whether
282 that's resources, time, or autonomy. She said we want them to feel supported by us and the
283 district as a whole, and to know that we trust their professional judgement and that we know
284 that with every engaging lesson they plan and every decision they carefully make we stand
285 behind them knowing their decisions are being made in the best interest of our children. She
286 said that we want them to feel the joy in teaching that made them go into this profession,
287 because in the end that is what turns our students into learners who are invested in themselves
288 and in their community. She said as parents they thank their teachers at King and other
289 teachers around the district for all they do for our children, families and community; thank you
290 for all the time, love and effort you give our children.

291
292 Jae Goodwin said she has spoken to the School Committee on many occasions over her tenure
293 as a teacher in Framingham, and tonight is the first time she is here with a heavy heart. She
294 said that the day teachers returned to school most of them entered filled with enthusiasm, but
295 in their professional development on that same day they were told that they would be devoting
296 2 ½ hours of their teaching week to social emotional learning. She said she doesn't think there
297 is one teacher here today that would disagree that students need more in this area, but
298 learning that there were going to be multiple initiatives rolled out at once was like a sharp
299 object poked into a balloon, and the deflated look on the teachers faces was the aftermath.
300 She said to learn about these various initiatives takes time, thought, and energy. She said that
301 since they have to teach five lessons each week, one would be assumed their planning time
302 could be used for it, but instead two planning periods are filled with coach meetings and the
303 three remaining 55 minutes also would have to be used to write lesson plans for all the other
304 subjects. She said requiring these lesson plans shows such mistrust in our teachers; if the
305 administrators are trusted to do due diligence they are aware of teachers who may need help
306 with their lesson plans, but directing all teachers to write lesson plans that will not improve
307 student learning is completely unjustified. She said that teaching is not a one-size fits all
308 profession; each classroom is filled with different children with different abilities and needs,
309 and the teachers must be trusted to get the job done, because they are the ones on the ground.
310 She said that this is her 21st year in Framingham and one of the worst climates she has ever
311 imagined. She said that this job is a very difficult one, but every day our teachers come to
312 school to do well by our students, actions such as those currently happening are eroding the
313 spirit and energy from our teachers, and that makes me, and I hope you, incredibly sad.

314

315 Sara MachKowsky said that she works at Hemenway and is here to share concerns with her
316 colleagues about the lesson planning procedure and the lack of clarity around the directions.
317 She said that they feel that the new lesson plan procedure is detrimental to student success
318 and teacher morale. She said that Hemenway has always planned meaningful and thoughtful
319 lessons with the support of their coaches and colleagues, and this year the opportunity has
320 been taken away from them, as instead during their planning time they are typing required
321 lesson plans. She said that they know that the new lesson plan expectations were set with
322 positive intent, but they want to make it clear that the effect is anything but positive. She said
323 that what we have been asked to do is to take the existing lesson plans and rewrite them in a
324 new format, and this is nothing but unnecessary work. She said this is sad and parents should
325 be concerned and this is not adding any actual value to teaching. She said she hopes that you
326 walk away this evening with a greater understanding of what the teachers are asking; we don't
327 want to stop planning, we don't want to stop having high expectations for our students, we
328 don't want to stop teaching, we just want to be heard.

329

330 Robert Bolles said he is here to speak about the Tab article about the inhouse option for the
331 school busses. He said this is not the problem of the bus company, Framingham and many
332 other towns around us are looking for bus drivers and that hasn't helped the problem at all. He
333 said he fought for 15 years to privatize the school busses, like virtually every single town around
334 us, it saved taxpayers millions on pensions and healthcare insurance over the years. He said he
335 knew from town meeting we had well over \$100 million in unfunded pensions. He said the
336 superintendent and whoever the School Committee is coming in has to get rid of school choice
337 and stop sending our children all over the town and causing all the bussing problems we have
338 had for years. He said that he has spoken here at a town meeting many times about bussing
339 and have stated many things that could be done, such as staggering start times. He said that he
340 spoke to this Committee months ago and said that when Rick Gallagher retires its going to take
341 a magician to replace him and make the system work at all. He said that he never ever wants to
342 hear the words in house bussing again it is too expensive and every town around us knows it.

343

344 Marianne Gately said that she has worked for FPS for the past 32 years during which time she
345 has seen many programs come and go. She said that she has seen the inclusion model change
346 from one in which where you have a full time teacher assistant to help you service the children
347 all day, to one where there is just one special education teacher in the room for some of the
348 day to just cover IEP minutes, and that is only if they are not pulled to cover a teacher who is
349 out. She said that the regular education teachers are then required to provide special
350 education services to students who are on IEPs while giving every other student in the room
351 exactly what they need. She said that unfortunately some classrooms have upwards of six or
352 more students on IEPs, many students on 504s, students who are dealing with traumatic events
353 in their lives, a student or two who cannot speak any English but are placed in your room
354 because all of the programs that they truly benefit from are full, and she said that it is a recipe
355 for what she guesses is a Level 3 school. She said that teachers should feel that they are the
356 most important piece of the Framingham schools, along with the students of course, and
357 should be treated as such. She said that she gets that teachers need plans, and that the district
358 wants to make sure that the curriculum is covered and that all students needs are met that

359 lessons have meaningful tasks and are challenging and that we have both language and content
360 objectives. She said that this is happening. She said what she doesn't get is why she doesn't
361 get to be creative anymore. She said that teachers have left or are planning on leaving
362 Framingham, and it is because of the demands put upon us by administrators that are seeping
363 into the personal lives of everyone. She said that the old saying if you give an inch they will
364 take a mile certainly applies here, we have given our inches, you have taken our miles and our
365 students are not better off for it.

366
367

368 Mr. Freudberg thanked those who came to public comment and said that hearing their
369 perspectives does help us all think of how to come to a compromise on this topic. He said that
370 within the role of the School Committee, they don't have a vote on the topic of lesson plans; as
371 it's not in contract per se, it's a management type operation, but that we care and have views
372 but at the moment there is no School Committee role. He said that there is a separate process
373 where it could get to the School Committee level, as the FTA is aware.

374

375 Superintendent's Update

376 Dr. Tremblay said he is not going to show the video on lesson planning as he originally had
377 planned, and wants to weave together lesson planning and achievement update on MCAS, and
378 address some concerns that were raised during public comment. He said that with the concern
379 around bussing, they are taking a multi-prong approach. He said that there are less drivers
380 daily than busses, the contract is with Durham who hires the drivers. He said that they have
381 tried to help promote for drivers, but it takes time to train drivers. He said that they could hold
382 Durham accountable, but even if they do so it doesn't get kids to school, so it would not solve
383 the problem. He said that they could also contract with another vendor and augment what we
384 have for additional drivers, but the problem is that it violates current contract, and other
385 vendors are not interested in signing on as they do not have enough drivers to service the
386 communities they are already working in. He said that looking at the District's school choice, he
387 does not think we should go to neighborhood schools as there are not enough on south side at
388 this time, and that would create questions regarding space and enrollment. He said the video
389 regarding lesson plans he tried to make personable, and make clear what some of the
390 expectations are, and it was not meant to be insulting, it was not scripted.

391

392 Assistant Superintendent for Secondary Education Anne Ludes and Assistant Superintendent of
393 Secondary presented on the 2019 MCAS and Accountability results. Ms. Ludes said that while
394 the Accountability results are impacted by MCAS, it is also impacted by other factors. She said
395 that Framingham High School (FHS) is responsible for all students who are enrolled in FHS prior
396 to October 1st and take the test, and the District is for all students - including students enrolled
397 after October 1st and students that are in other placements such as collaboratives, so it will
398 look a little different on the District versus FHS tenth grade numbers. She said that the Fuller
399 Turnaround Plan falls within a school needing focused/targeted support and has a very
400 comprehensive plan in place to support improvement, and they have received feedback from
401 the state and they have met or exceeded all criteria on the Turnaround Plan. She said that
402 Cameron does not need a Turnaround Plan, but would benefit from additional supports; they
403 have identified several targets with achievement, conduct, attendance, and classroom

404 instruction, along with progress monitoring timelines and action steps to meet the goals. She
405 said that when you look at the high school, where they did not make gains, it is within the
406 lowest performing 25% of students rather than the all students category. She said that they are
407 looking at curriculum to make it engaging and accessible to students, and offering a course for
408 30 teachers in Universal Design for Learning, which is designed to provide teachers with a
409 framework for planning lessons so they offer access and challenge to all students regardless of
410 any gaps that they have in their learning. She said that another area where they didn't make
411 gains they wanted is within graduation rates. She said that Principal Banach removed the
412 practice of reduced credit for absences that students have passed, as if they can demonstrate
413 mastery of the subject they should receive full credit. She said this should help reduce the
414 retention rate and keep more students on track to graduate. She said that Principal Banach has
415 added early college coursework into the school day, where students can take college credit
416 earning classes during the school day, which gives all students access.

417
418 Dr. Tremblay said they know that there is thoughtful lesson planning going on, but they are
419 looking to make sure we are delivering the full scope and sequence of instruction for a school
420 year, and that is not always happening as there have been missed units where classes have not
421 achieved the entire curriculum. He said that they still want teachers to use creativity, but also
422 to have expectations in some areas. He said that they are not looking to teach to the MCAS,
423 they are teaching to the standards, and the MCAS tests the students knowledge of those
424 standards. He said they are trying to bring consistency of practice, and not looking to have all
425 teachers on the same lesson at the same time on the same day. He said they are going to set
426 up three meetings as a workshop model to hear feedback as he wants it to be a cooperative
427 effort. He said looking at the accountability percentiles he thinks we can do better, and that it
428 needs to be addressed. Ms. Bright said when discussing tiers of schools it is not meant to be in
429 a derogatory way, it's meant to provide additional support to those schools. So in the Tier II
430 and Tier III schools they are providing added supports and putting different contracted
431 professional development into place to help with that. She said that there were resources
432 missing in schools with no reason as to why, and that has been rectified to make sure there are
433 equal resources, now they are looking at how that has impacted schools, and how individuals
434 are using those resources. She said that team time is for deeper discussions and that plans can
435 change for many different reasons, and it is meant to have a discussion around them.

436
437 **Questions.** Mr. Freudberg reminded members that there is a need to respect the Collective
438 Bargaining Agreement when asking questions. He said that he read in the Q&A about lesson
439 plans that lesson plans were already in teachers' job descriptions, and asked what has changed.
440 Ms. Bright said that the pieces that have changed this year have involved discussing with the
441 Union consistency within building and instructional leadership. She said that this included
442 making team times intentional and impactful, and a Monday expectation for lessons plans to be
443 uploaded to a drive with the five components. Mr. Wadland asked how DESE determines
444 aggregation by school, and said that he is interested in looking at how certain subgroups are
445 performing across schools. He said he would like to have a discussion about the data, and what
446 we are doing about the data, and making sure giving every student is getting what they need to
447 be successful. He said that in the last three meetings they have heard from a number of FTA
448 members about lesson plans, and said this format is not a productive format to work through

449 this, and suggested reconvening the Unit A Subcommittee; to sit down and hash through it. He
450 said we are caught in the middle of two different stories, and he hopes a solution can be
451 worked out away from the tvs and the press. Mr. Freudberg said they have reached out to the
452 FTA regarding scheduling a meeting, but due to the grievance there is a need to wait unless
453 there is a side agreement. Ms. Pascual said this data is informative to the committee in order
454 to make decisions. She said that she didn't vote for the budget, because we knew this data
455 would come out this way, and she did not see where we were giving additional support. She
456 said she is highly alarmed that the results continue to be at this flat line and we haven't dove
457 deeper into student achievement and accountability. She said that she wants to know what
458 has occurred to date to help address the concerns of the teachers. Dr. Tremblay said that
459 regarding the flat line she mentioned, he has continued to say that what we had been doing has
460 not been working. He said that he disagrees with the budget comment, and this can be
461 discussed further, and added that they will be building the next budget in a matter of days.
462 Ms. Bryant asked how long it should take to fill out lesson plan. Ms. Bright said reading and
463 math lesson plans were started last year, and it depends on what teachers are tweaking and
464 learning. She said that the one shown in public comment was from a school that has already
465 been doing lesson plans for the last two years. Ms. Bryant says the methodology seems a little
466 rushed and flawed. Dr. Tremblay said they can go back to the negotiating table, but at what
467 point do we say we need to do something different. He said that when we have a school in the
468 7th percentile that has three times more resources than the other schools we have a problem.
469 He said that we want to work cooperatively, but at some point they need to hold the line and
470 have expectations. Ms. Bryant said that she does not agree with bringing it to the negotiation
471 table, she said that it's more about curriculum and teaching, and will need a different venue.
472 She asked why certain schools did so much better than others. Ms. Ludes said she cannot
473 speak to why, but they can look to use the practices they are using there for other schools. She
474 said this is the first year of this generation of MCAS, so one cannot look at one year in isolation,
475 there is a need to see if it's a trend that continues. She said they are doing a 6-12th grade ELA
476 curriculum review, and within the high school one needs to keep in mind that students have
477 two years to get ready to take the MCAS in tenth grade. Ms. Bailey asked for clarification about
478 losing credits for absences, because she had heard differently regarding classes that were cut.
479 Ms. Ludes said she would have to look into that.

480

481 The Chair called for a five minute recess. Recessed at 9:02 p.m.

482

483 The Chair called the meeting back to order at 9:07 p.m.

484

485 FY21 Capital Budget Presentation and Vote to Submit FPS Request to Mayor

486 Mr. Finlay said the Facilities Subcommittee met and went through the capital budget needs.
487 Director of Building and Grounds Matthew Torti presented the Capital Budget
488 recommendations for FY21, as approved by the Facilities Subcommittee 4-0, which include
489 exterior envelope, paving/stormwater, HVAC, and security upgrades for a total recommended
490 request of \$5,105,000.00.

491 **Questions.** Mr. Wadland asked about the deferred projects listed and if these projects had a
492 budget has been allocated but not expended yet. Mr. Lynch said no, the deferred projects are
493 ones in the long term plan that should happen in FY21, but they prioritized four top projects, so

494 those five projects listed are deferred to FY22. He said that ADA compliance and asbestos still
495 has some money left from projects in FY19, but the ones listed are not projects that are already
496 funded. Mr. Wadland said that he would like to see how and where playground maintenance
497 can get factored into the operational budget. He said that they have received grants in the
498 past, but on top of involving a community build, a new playground usually requires schools
499 looking to raise a certain amount of money, which is a measure of the socioeconomic power of
500 that school. Mr. Torti said playgrounds used to be a lot simpler and they have evolved into
501 remarkable pieces of equipment. He said that Parent Teacher Organizations (PTOs) have done
502 fundraising for playgrounds in the past, and maintenance was handled by Building and
503 Grounds; there was never a line item in the operational budget to address it. He said the
504 money from renting the school buildings, which is kept in the civic revolving account, has
505 helped fund it since the PTOs decided they did not want to put the money into playgrounds. He
506 said that there are a lot of different ways that they can make it work without addressing the
507 capital budget. Ms. Pascual asked how the projects were chosen and when the start dates are.
508 Mr. Torti said that the exterior envelope project is a priority as once water infiltrates a building
509 it can cause indoor air problems like mold, and this is a proactive approach. He said that the
510 stormwater project is mandated for the entire City, and the school department is in charge of
511 their part. He said that HVAC at Barbieri is nonoperational so it is a must, and it is the desire of
512 the Committee for the work on HVAC at McCarthy; it as rated the hottest temperatures on the
513 second floor. He said there is a need to also continue to expand security systems. He added
514 that there are many other needs, but given the history of available funds these were chosen.
515 Ms. Pascual asked if the deferral of the asbestos removal project at Thayer will affect the
516 students. Mr. Torti said this is a proactive approach and is not a risk right now. Mr. Lynch said
517 as for a start date they asked for a legal opinion and were told as soon as the City Council
518 approves it, and the Mayor and City Solicitor signs it, they can start. He said that they can go
519 out for bids ahead of time with the anticipation of starting the projects. Mr. Epstein said that it
520 looks like deferral of projects is becoming more of an issue. Mr. Torti said they participated in a
521 meeting that the Mayor held where they gave an update on all of the school buildings, and
522 what the main priorities are for each building. He said that items are deferred due to available
523 funding, and they need to look at how to keep the buildings safe. Mr. Epstein asked if any of
524 the problem was due to the funding not being available until later, and if moving the process
525 earlier would help. Mr. Torti said that was a problem last summer, but the amount of funding
526 that is actually needed is too large. He said it would help if they could start the projects the day
527 school ends. Mr. Epstein said that Barbieri is currently the only school that has five lunches
528 periods which start early due to the size of the cafeteria, and asked if there was any planning on
529 expanding the cafeteria, such as within the library which has space. Mr. Torti said there was
530 nothing in the que, but can look into that. He said he would prefer not to take library space,
531 but they have looked at other classrooms. Mr. Epstein asked that when Brophy is having a lot
532 of work done in the parking lot due to stormwater, could preparation also be done for solar
533 panels. Mr. Torti said first they would need to take solar readings to see if there is enough solar
534 exposure to justify the expenses. He said that they have started the process as part of the
535 Fuller Project for the parking lot to have solar canopies, as approved by the School Building
536 Committee. Mr. Finlay said that they have a lot of projects put on them and next summer they
537 will be moving into the new Fuller building which will take a lot, so there is a need to keep in
538 mind what projects will need to be taken away. Mr. Torti said this is something they will have

539 to plan for and build into the schedule and be mindful of. Mayor Spicer asked if certain
540 buildings were in more dire need of needing exterior envelope work, and asked if some projects
541 could be done throughout the school year. Mr. Torti said yes, but they would have to have
542 contractors go through the CORI process and coordinate. Mayor Spicer asked if stormwater
543 and paving needs at Brophy were in collaboration with the DPW and wonders if it could be put
544 into the state appropriation ask. Mr. Torti said he will send over all the data for her to look at.
545 Mr. Freudberg said this project was deferred from previous years so it definitely needs to be
546 completed this year, and to be mindful of the time constraint in the charter requirements.

547 **Motion:** To accept the FPS and Facilities Subcommittee recommendation of \$2 million for
548 exterior envelope at multiple schools, \$955,000 for paving and stormwater at Brophy, \$1.7
549 million for HVAC at McCarthy and Barbieri and \$450,000 for security at multiple schools.

550 **Moved:** Mr. Finlay **Seconded:** Ms. Hugo **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

551 Ms. Bryant asked how soon air conditioning will be in McCarthy. Mr. Torti said the funding
552 approval is needed before starting the schematic process.

553

554 Approval of Proprietary Specification for Materials for the Fuller Building Project, as Required
555 by the MA School Building Authority and as Requested by the School Building Committee on
556 September 16th

557 **Motion:** To approve the Proprietary Specification for Materials for the Fuller Building Project,
558 as Required by the MA School Building Authority.

559 **Moved:** Mr. Wadland **Seconded:** Mr. Alexander

560 **Discussion:** Ms. Bryant asked if sustainability is involved with the Fuller Project. Mr. Freudberg
561 said yes, but that topic does not have to do with the vote on proprietary specification for
562 materials with safety so it can be discussed later.

563 **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

564

565 Mr. Lynch said there was nothing pressing for **enrollment** and **budget** at this time, so this
566 section can be postponed due to the lateness of the meeting. He said he will have information
567 regarding the negative food balances at the next meeting. Dr. Tremblay said they are still
568 within policy regulation in regards to classroom sizes at this point, and they looked at the data
569 that will be submitted to DESE versus the McKibben estimates.

570

571 Mr. Freudberg said that for **announcements from the Chair** - today is national Custodians
572 Recognition Day. He said that last night the City Council approved the City Seal. He said that
573 there were emails sent out to parents and guardians this week on absenteeism and about
574 dangers on vaping.

575

576 Student Advisory Committee Presentation on Future Presentations and Goals

577 Student Advisory Committee members Nick Small, Rose Bailey, and Edie Bassett presented on
578 updates for the Student Advisory Council, their goals, and future presentations. Mr. Freudberg
579 said that they will be on a December agenda and will give updates every two months during the
580 school year.

581 **Questions.** Ms. Bryant asked what additional methods they will be using this year to get
582 feedback from more students. Mr. Small said the "Day in the Life of a FHS Student" video could
583 help with showing student perspectives, and said that data doesn't have to be quantitative, it

584 can be qualitative through clubs or interviews with free responses rather than ratings in
585 surveys.

586

587 Subcommittee Reports

588 **Finance and Operations Subcommittee.** Mr. Epstein said that two warrants were signed.

589

590 Mr. Finlay and Mr. Freudberg said at the last **Facilities Subcommittee** meeting there was
591 discussion around the power purchase agreement for solar canopies for the Fuller Middle
592 School Project. Mr. Freudberg said that there needs to be coordination between multiple
593 entities and this will be put on a future agenda.

594

595 Ms. Hugo said that there will be an **Accountability and Student Achievement Subcommittee**
596 meeting on October 7, 2019 prior to the Strategic Initiative and Finance Oversight Committee's
597 public hearing on education. She said the agenda includes a deep dive into the MCAS data and
598 work on the homework policy.

599

600 Mr. Freudberg said there was a **Communications Subcommittee** meeting on September 23,
601 2019 where they reviewed a number of items such as the translation office, some ideas for the
602 next budget process, and additional supports within the Media and Communications office. He
603 said that they also had community members come and brainstorm ways that social media
604 interactions between FPS and the public can be enhanced and improved. He added that the
605 audio recording of the meeting is online, and he will have draft minutes up this week.

606

607 Ms. Pascual said that there is a **Racial Equity Subcommittee** meeting scheduled for October 15,
608 2019 at 7:00 p.m. with a focus on reviewing data from the equity office. She said that the
609 equity audit has gone out to bid and we have received only two responses, but she will be
610 meeting with the Assistant Superintendent of Equity, Diversity and Community Development
611 next week to review them and figure out next steps.

612

613 Mr. Alexander said he will be setting up a meeting soon for the **Digital Infrastructure**
614 **Subcommittee.**

615

616 Referral to Legal Counsel for a Response to a R. Alexander Open Meeting Law Complaint Dated 617 October 1, 2019

618 **Motion:** To refer the Open Meeting Law complaint filed by Mr. Alexander to School Committee
619 counsel, working with the Chair, to draft a response.

620 **Moved:** Mr. Wadland **Seconded:** Mr. Finlay **Vote:** 8-0-1

621 (Yes: Hugo, Finlay, Wadland, Freudberg, Alexander, Epstein, Maskell, Pascual. Abstained:
622 Bryant).

623 **Discussion:** Mr. Freudberg reminded members that legal advised that the discussion only be
624 about the referral process and not the complaint itself. Ms. Pascual asked why this is being
625 referred to legal, and asked if the Committee has to vote on this. Mr. Freudberg said that the
626 Open Meeting Law guide has all the rules, information was emailed to members, and this is the
627 process that the committee is required to follow as a public body. Ms. Bryant asked if there will
628 be a time to discuss the complaint. Mr. Freudberg said if the motion passes the process is for

629 the City Solicitor to submit a response on the committee's behalf, and it will be a public
630 document for all to see.

631
632 Vote to Appoint a Voting Member and an Alternate to Represent the School Committee at the
633 Massachusetts Association of School Committee (MASC)'s Annual Meeting, and direct them on
634 how to vote on Resolutions

635 Ms. Maskell said that she believes it is a problem within equity and opportunity, as some
636 members do not have funds available to be reimbursed after paying upfront for a hotel room.
637 She said other districts have a credit card and make purchases ahead of time, but within
638 Framingham the City has said no. She said that she finds it difficult to understand that if other
639 towns can do it, why Framingham can't, and would like the Chief Financial Officer Mary Ellen
640 Kelly to explain why that is. She said that this is causing her to be excluded from an opportunity
641 to continue to be educated and informed on things going on. Mr. Freudberg said they
642 discussed this at the Finance and Operations Subcommittee, where they asked why a credit
643 card cannot be made available like other school districts have, as the Committee voted to
644 approve the cost of the conference and reimbursements. He asked if there were any updates
645 from the City, and where in City bylaw or Mass General Laws it says this is not allowed. Mr.
646 Lynch said that the answer is coming from the City Treasurer's Office, and they believe that
647 there is just too much opportunity for misuse and for not following procedures. Mr. Lynch said
648 he can open the dialogue up again and report back, and let them know it's the committees
649 desire to figure out why we can't do this. Mr. Freudberg suggested that a back up plan to
650 make a specific hotel a vendor. Mr. Lynch said some hotels will invoice us, but most will not.
651 Mr. Finlay said the Committee should create a policy to make sure this doesn't happen in the
652 future, and said that it is discouraging as when Framingham went from a town to a city, the
653 Committee became more diverse and now members are not able to go due to this. Mr. Epstein
654 said that it seems it is a matter of if the City trusts the Executive Director of Finance or not with
655 a credit card, and he already controls a large budget. He said that it is a procedural thing from
656 the past. Ms. Bryant said we are about equity and representation and in order for all of us to
657 be able to make a contribution we have to push this issue. Mr. Wadland said he would like to
658 appoint Ms. Maskell as the delegate, and given that time is of the essence, he will do anything
659 he personally can do to make sure she can attend if this cannot be settled with the treasurer,
660 he said that this is inexcusable.

661 **Motion:** To appoint Tiffanie Maskell as the voting member and Geoff Epstein as the alternate
662 at the MASC Annual Meeting.

663 **Moved:** Mr. Wadland **Seconded:** Mr. Freudberg

664 **Discussion:** Mr. Freudberg said an alternate also needs to be voted on, and asked Ms. Hugo if
665 she is eligible. Ms. Hugo said she could not be, as she already had input and a vote on the
666 resolutions through MASC. Ms. Hugo asked for a friendly amendment to appoint Geoff Epstein
667 as the voting alternate. No objection. Ms. Pascual said when she started on this Committee
668 equity was one of the biggest things for her - access to resources such as computers,
669 smartphones, emails, and internet, and this was the same issue last year for the conference, so
670 she helped other members be able to go and got reimbursed. She said that she is going to
671 abstain from this vote as she is not allowed to attend due to a vote taken at a previous meeting
672 only making members-elect eligible.

673 **Vote:** 8-0-1 (Yes: Hugo, Finlay, Wadland, Freudberg, Alexander, Epstein, Maskell, Bryant.
674 Abstained: Pascual).

675
676 Ms. Hugo said that MASC is recommending passing all of the resolutions, she read the title of all
677 the resolutions that were provided. Ms. Bryant said it is not good to look at charter schools as
678 the enemy, as they are part of the education family, and in general need to be more
679 consolidatory with them and bring them into the fold and not be enemy camps. Ms. Hugo said
680 the resolution regarding charter schools is more focusing on that there is no one size fits all, but
681 to not take so much money away from public schools, and for charter school to find a different
682 source of income.

683 **Motion:** To accept the recommendation of the MASC Resolutions Committee in supporting
684 these resolutions and MASC bylaw proposals, and to direct our delegate to vote in favor of said
685 resolutions and bylaw changes at the convention.

686 **Moved:** Mr. Wadland **Seconded:** Ms. Hugo **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

687

688 Approval of Grants/Gifts/Field Trips

689 **Motion:** To approve the September 4, 2019 Open Session minutes.

690 **Moved:** Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Mr. Finlay **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

691

692 **Motion:** To accept the gift of \$250.00 from Align Credit Union for field trips and non-
693 curriculum education materials.

694 **Moved:** Ms. Bryant **Seconded:** Mr. Epstein **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

695 **Motion:** To accept the gift of \$32.50 from We Are All in This Together for Early Childhood
696 Alliance.

697 **Moved:** Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Ms. Maskell **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

698

699 Mr. Freudberg said that a field trip proposal for the Model Congress team was just recently
700 received, and they would like to be approved tonight. He said that this is the fifteenth straight
701 year they have gone, and this field trip was approved last year by this Committee.

702 **Motion:** To approve the FHS Model Congress Field Trip to Yale Model Congress Conference.

703 **Moved:** Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Mr. Finlay

704 **Discussion:** Mr. Wadland said that this is not on the revised agenda. Mr. Freudberg said he did
705 not hear about it in time, it is within the Open Meeting Law as he did not know about it 48
706 hours in advance. Mr. Wadland said that with the recent OML complaints he is concerned
707 about it.

708 **Motion:** To table the vote until the next meeting.

709 **Moved:** Mr. Wadland **Seconded:** Ms. Bryant

710 **Discussion:** Mr. Freudberg said he will vote against the motion to table; there is no OML
711 violation, and there is an email chain showing he was not aware of it 48 hours before. Ms.
712 Bryant said the field trip is not until December, so it wouldn't hurt to wait, and it would be
713 more consistent to not bring items up at the last minute, so as to not be playing favorites. Mr.
714 Freudberg said that FHS staff asked for it to be approved now in order to plan. Ms. Hugo said
715 that families need time to raise money and get things in order. Mr. Alexander asked if there
716 would be any adverse effects if we were to delay the vote. Dr. Tremblay said he does not
717 know, he said they possibly could still plan with pending approval. Ms. Maskell said since we

718 cannot make a judgement if holding off would be a problem, and the Committee approved it
719 last year, she doesn't know why it would need to be postponed.

720 **Vote to Table:** 2-6-1 (Yes: Wadland, Bryant. No: Hugo, Finlay, Freudberg, Alexander, Epstein,
721 Maskell. Abstained: Pascual).

722 **Vote on Main Motion:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

723

724 Second Round of Public Comment

725 Robert Bolles said that he wanted to comment on what Mr. Wadland said about what
726 happened tonight with the teacher's union. He said that he agrees with him that it could have
727 been handled a little better and hopes they start doing that and things work out a little better.

728

729 Adjournment

730 **Motion:** To adjourn.

731 **Moved:** Mr. Epstein **Seconded:** Mr. Finlay **Vote:** Unanimous (9-0-0)

732 Meeting adjourned at 10:20 p.m.

733

734 Meeting Materials

735 Agenda

736 FY21 Capital Budget Proposed Projects

737 Property Specification for Materials for the Fuller Building Project

738 2019 MCAS and Accountability

739 Superintendent Video Regarding Lesson Plans

740 FY20 Budget Status

741 Free and Reduced Lunch Applications Report

742 Enrollment Statistics for 2019-2020 School Year

743 Student Advisory Committee Presentation

744 Warrants

745 OML Complaint

746 Report of the MASC Resolutions Committee

747 September 4, 2019 Draft Open Session Minutes

748 Gift from Align Credit Union for Field Trips and Non-Curriculum Education Materials

749 Gifts from We Are All in This Together for Early Childhood Alliance

750 FHS Model Congress Field Trip to Yale Model Congress Conference