



Framingham Public Schools

Robert A. Tremblay, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools

SCHOOL COMMITTEE

Adam Freudberg, Chair • Gloria Pascual, Vice Chair • Tracey Bryant, Clerk
Noval Alexander • Geoffrey Epstein • Richard A. Finlay
Beverly Hugo • Tiffanie Maskell • Scott Wadland
Yvonne M. Spicer, Mayor

73 Mount Wayte Avenue, Second Floor, Framingham, MA 01702
Telephone: 508-626-9121 Fax: 508-877-4240

SCHOOL COMMITTEE: OPEN MEETING MINUTES

DATE AND TIME: April 24, 2019 at 7:00 P.M.

LOCATION: Framingham High School - Room
115 A Street, Framingham

MEETING CALLED BY: Chair Adam Freudberg

PRESENT: Noval Alexander
Tracey Bryant
Geoffrey Epstein
Richard A. Finlay
Adam Freudberg
Beverly Hugo
Tiffanie Maskell
Mayor Yvonne Spicer

ABSENT: Gloria Pascual
Scott Wadland

ALSO PRESENT: Nicholas Small, Chair of Student Advisory Committee
Dr. Tremblay, Superintendent
Lincoln Lynch, Director of Finance and Operations
Judy Styer, Director of Health and Wellness
Amy Bright, Assistant Superintendent for Elementary Education
Dr. Sam Wong, Framingham Director of Public Board of Health
Casey Bell, Manager of Secondary Out of School Time
Reyhad Shad, Framingham High School Out of School
Time Coordinator

The Chair called the meeting to order at 7:06 p.m.

Call to Order

The Chair announced that this meeting was being broadcast live on local cable, as well as for later playback, and on Facebook Live. He said that the Committee met earlier in executive session to discuss strategy with respect to collective bargaining or litigation about a request from an employee to hear a grievance, to discuss the status of the two separate leases for the Farley and Perini Buildings, and to review previous executive session minutes to be in compliance with reviewing the minutes at reasonable intervals to determine if the provisions of the subsection warrant continued non-disclosure, as well as to approve recent executive session minutes. He added that members Scott Wadland and Gloria Pascual will be absent from the meeting due to prior commitments.

Public Comment

Brendan Murray started by saying that he works for Stand for Children, which he said is a non-profit organization that is focused on early literacy and high school success. He said he is here to give an opportunity to the people in the community to be able to organize for themselves, for different bills that are coming through the State House, regarding fair funding. He said that in this district 62% of students are not reading at grade level by the third grade; and that students stop learning to read at the third grade, and begin reading to learn. He said he wants to make sure this (the reading lag) is decreased for Framingham and throughout the entire state. He said that one of the ways to do so is to focus on making sure we are getting equitable money in the budget for each district. He added that Boston seems to get the most, but that he wants to make sure that a gateway city such as Framingham, receives the money it deserves, to make sure we are all getting the same equitable education. He said that Stand for Children is holding an information session regarding the upcoming bills, and would love to pair with the School District and Committee to make sure as many people as possible are invited. He added that there is no time and date yet, but that he wants to work in conjunction with the District, so all the residents have the information they need. He said he will also share information for taking action right now, including templates of letters that can be sent and a phone line to be able to call in and leave any messages they would like to leave when it comes to fair funding. He said that they are going to present to state leadership, which will be an opportunity to show that all the voices combined will matter more than just one phone call, which may not get the same kind of play that their organization pumping out the messages would. He said that they are a member organization and want to make sure that they are listening to their members, and their members have said that this is the number one issue.

Gerry Bloomfield did a recitation that included the following lines: ...I tried a sanctuary city and found it no comfort there. I looked for America and saw eight dealers and hustlers, hands full of marijuana and dripping in blood... I saw islands of plastic debris floating in our oceans, I saw emotionally stressed out people everywhere, I saw vigils for troubled teens staying in school, 40% of them their lives were already in turmoil. Families fighting to keep together what paranoia, can we still pray can we?

Sarah McKeon said she is a former PTO President and a current kindergarten teacher, and is here to focus on students as they are what matters most, and she has serious concerns about the Mayor's decision to lower the budget number. She said that she sat on the negotiating team, and for months they bargained in good faith, came to agreements, and voted through a

new contract; the whole time people on both sides of the table were transparent, open to questions and suggestions, and in the end thought the numbers were workable. She said she does not understand the “trimming the fat” as it’s been referred to online, and that she thinks the public school budget is not the fat that we want to trim. She said that we hear over and over again that we must do what’s best for our students and asked when we are actually going to follow practicing what we preach, because taking away from an already strapped system is not going to help, it’s going to hurt and we are already hurting. . She said that smaller classes are a huge need, as well as more interventionists to support our struggling students, and guidance counselors and social workers for the ever increasing social and emotional needs of our students. She said that throughout the Mayor’s campaign her history as an educator was touted as a strength, and that she is hoping that the Mayor and her staff will truly reflect on that, and consider what is needed to help the system and not harm it. She said that she implores the Mayor to commit to the Superintendent's budget, as it is based on information that he, his staff, and those in the schools who truly experience the needs and challenges on a daily basis, have provided, and their word is the one that should be trusted and our students are the ones who should be reaping the rewards of the system that is properly supported and budgeted.

Framingham Teachers’ Association (FTA) President Christine Mulroney said that she is here to voice the FTA’s support for the Promise Act which she said provides the best path towards fully funding public education in the State, and the one that fully meets the goals outlined by the Foundation Budget Review Commission Report. She said that with the Promise Act, the increase over the baseline of Chapter 70 aid from the State in fiscal year 2020 is \$181 million, while Governor Baker’s bill in comparison increases it by \$43 million. She said that Governor Baker’s education bill gives the Commissioner of Education the power to withhold funds from districts deemed low performing, adding that this means more bureaucracy, more testing and less time on authentic teaching. She said that the FTA also supports the Promise Act because 3/4 of the new funding would go to 20% of the districts with the largest percentage of low income enrollment. She said that Stand for Children has recently re-entered Massachusetts amid the school funding debate. She said that this organization has been active in promoting charter school growth and derives much of its national funding from the same sources that supported Question 2, and the attempted charter school expansion in 2016 - and that they cannot be considered a pro-public education group given their history of support for privatization of public schools. She said that FTA members are headed to a rally on Boston Common on May 16th to advocate for the Promise Act. She said that today the Mayor, although a former teacher, released her budget number for the School Department with only a 3.1% increase from the FY19 Budget despite the reduced number the Superintendent forwarded which was 5.6%. She said that School Committee members eventually settled on supporting a 4.57% over FY19 which will provide for some of what the District leadership had asked for, however even this reduction would have a limited support of initiatives and expansion programs and services for our students. She said that she thinks that the Mayor’s budget proposal is a slap in the face to the hard work the educators do every day; not only will it not provide what our students need to be successful, it will take away necessary positions from being added, and in fact it more likely means the reduction of positions. She said now good teachers, who will be cut, will begin to look elsewhere for jobs; Framingham trained them and other districts will benefit from the preparation we provided. She said that she appeals to

Mayor Spicer to reconsider and return the budget to a number where it should be; one where the schools can provide the high quality instruction and implementation of programs to support our students needs and to support the fine educators that work hard every day to provide a positive learning environment.

Brian Fanous said he is a PTO Officer, but is speaking on behalf of himself. He said that he wants to strongly voice his support for the School Committee approved budget and hopes that the Mayor will seriously reconsider her proposed budget of a 3.1% increase. He said that because he is on the PTO he is inside the building almost every day, and sees the amazing work the teachers are doing, and the diminished resources they have and sees the effect that the support staff have to ensure every child gets what they need to succeed,. He asked how it is possible that the Mayor is proposing a budget that could require cuts to staff while at same time proclaiming to be pro-education. He said that we are not at the point in the District where we can slow down, and we need to increase spending to ensure equity across the district He said this is not a “we want”, it is a “we need” these things and the students need these things. . He said a budget is an indication of one’s values, and being pro-education is something more than you stick on a campaign flyer, and he said that this budget proposal is not a pro-education budget and he, and parents, are disappointed. He said he would like to see the City Council and the Mayor back the School Committee budget of a 4.57% increase.

Former School Committee member C. Patrick Dunne says he does not want to see us reverse the progress that we are starting to make with the new Superintendent and School Committee. He said that the City is a system, and all parts have to be functioning; the school is your brain and your growth power, and the City is the heart, and the funding comes from the heart. He said that if the funding doesn't get to the brain, it's just like us, our brain cells die pretty quickly when we are not getting sufficient energy and oxygen. He said he thinks that we are at a critical moment now - where we go forward and keep the path to improve, or we go backwards. He said it is a lot harder to put things back together again than it is to let them drift apart. He said that we cannot rely on the State to make up the difference. He said that the worth of our houses are directly related to the school performance perception, and once we start the downhill path, younger people are going to leave the town, you are not going to attract new buyers, and older people are going to be stuck with increasing values.

MTA Staff Member Barbara Connery said she has reservations regarding Stand for Children’s recent re-emerging in Massachusetts. She says she fears that it may be cloaked in a push for more school funding, but worries if it suggests a new assault on pressing for more privatization, coupled with the attack on educators. She said that Stand for Children is part of a new coalition with the Massachusetts Education Equity Partnership (M.E.E.P.) whose members include groups that have been hostile to the Massachusetts Teachers Association (M.T.A) and many of the local affiliates across the country. She said that now these groups are seeking to take over the education funding debate; arguing that the lack of resources and that students reading abilities are compounded by poor quality teachers, and she says that she thinks that they will offer a fix that is likely to include more charters and curb public schools. She said that Stand for Children and the new coalition rely on some of the largest supporters of charters, and many of these donors also support anti-teacher and anti-union groups. She said that with a history of anti-teacher organization, it’s hard for her to believe that this coalition is interested in a

pro-public education agenda. She said that Stand for Children has challenged collective bargaining and M.E.E.P. members and seek to work as alternatives to the M.T.A. and local affiliate unions, where they have tried to speak for teachers and support education privatization. She said that she urges everyone to consider who they are engaging with and doing business with, and consider using your best resources - your educators, your teachers, and let's continue to work to develop a strong public school system in Framingham.

Dhruba Sen said there is a saying of "don't touch the third line", and in this case the third line would be the children's center, women's center, senior center and the public schools. He said as a previous speaker alluded to, the budget is a value statement and he fully support the School Committee budget. He said in regards to the agenda item on sustainability, he thinks the students and schools can help out by planning tree planting events.

City Councilor Michael Cannon said that we have made so much progress with the strong leadership we have now - and the educators in our schools, we should be growing and not taking away from. He said that he has spoken before on saving money in our community, and he could see if all the fat on the City side had been trimmed; if the Mayor was not proposing any new positions, or any new spending, maybe he could see coming around to the minimum number Dr. Tremblay got to in previous meetings. He said that he doesn't understand being blindsided by 2% after all of those meetings and no meaningful input from the Mayor, to arrive at that number and then to get a press release talking about an increase of 3.1%. He said that there is too much of a delta and he doesn't see that the work that has been done by the administration to squeeze every penny, and sharpen every pencil, to arrive at that number. He said that he is worried that we are getting so close to the absolutely drop dead deadline for the budget, that there will be no time for the administration and the Mayor to find out how to provide our children, and the legacy of Framingham, with resources that they need especially now. He said he does agree with something the Mayor said in a previous meeting, where she referenced that the funding increases every year for the schools are unsustainable, but he said that we are not going to be adding an entire new grade level at King every year, or similar major additions, and that this is just not the year to do this and he doesn't know how you can meaningfully pay attention to the debate that has been going on this budget cycle over the past year plus and come to these numbers.

Robert Bolles said that he was at the last School Committee meeting when the Mayor questioned the increase of the school budget over the past few years, which he questions himself. He said that she has to help the overburdened taxpayers, and there are ways the School Committee and Superintendent can save money and keep the Budget within the range of the 3.1% increase.

Announcements from the Chair

The Chair said that it is Denim Day - a day within Sexual Violence Awareness Month where wearing jeans or denim is a visible stance against the misconception about sexual violence, as well as supporting survivors. He thanked the new Domestic Violence Task Force for bringing the day to members attention.

Upon Request of Mayor Spicer, an Invitation to Join the City Pride Month Proclamation and Pride Flag Raising Ceremony

Mayor Spicer said that diversity comes in many forms, and it is our duty as community leaders to make sure everyone feels safe and welcome in our city. She said that at the March 7th Community Conversation About Diversity and Inclusion, the community discussed the importance of embracing our differences, encouraging inclusion, and respecting each other. She said that this Pride Proclamation does exactly that. She said that June 28, 2019 marks the 50th anniversary of the Stonewall Uprising, which is widely acknowledged as the defining event in LGBTQ+ Rights Movement. She said that on Saturday, June 1st at 11:30 a.m., at the Memorial Plaza at City Hall, they will commemorate this anniversary by raising the Rainbow Flag. She asks that the Superintendent, School Committee, and City Councilors join her in honoring our LGBTQ+ community and has a proclamation for everyone to be able to sign.

Motion: To join the Mayor in signing this proclamation, as well as lending the School Committee name as a cosponsor to the Pride Flag Raising Ceremony on June 1, 2019.

Moved: Mr. Finlay **Seconded:** Ms. Hugo **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Discussion: Ms. Bryant asked if the raising of the flag would occur solely at the Memorial Building or also at schools. Mayor Spicer said the flag will be raised at Memorial Plaza.

Health and Wellness and Department of Health Report on Vaping

Health and Wellness Director Judy Styer, Dr. Sam Wong, Director of the Framingham Board of Health, Secondary Out of School Time Manager Casey Bell, and Framingham High School Out of School Time Coordinator Reyhad Shad presented on vaping - who it impacts, the current efforts that the District and community have been doing, including getting a grant to start a local 84 Chapter which is a statewide movement of youth fighting tobacco in Massachusetts.

Discussion: Mr. Freudberg said there is a need for a whole of government approach; he said that this is a state, local, and national issue and is a public health crisis. He said he asked two assistant district attorney generals what school communities can do - they said if anyone knows online vendors, they are required to have a two factor ID to confirm ages, if they are not doing so please contact the District or the Massachusetts Attorney General's Office. Mr. Alexander asked if the Department of Health is coordinating with any neighboring towns to synergize and all be on the same page, because students could just go to the next town over and get the products. Dr. Wong said Framingham is one of the founding municipalities of the MetroWest Tobacco Control District. He said that when they passed the regulation last year, it was consistent across the entire district - 9 communities roughly around the same time, and they are hoping to do the same with the restriction regarding menthol and mint tobacco products. Mr. Small said that he appreciates what they are doing because it really is an epidemic, and it's not only bad for students who are using it, but also for students who don't want to use the bathroom because they don't want to see students vaping or be in the same room as them, and this causes restrictions. He said that he really likes the idea of a student focus group, as students will really listen to other students. Mr. Epstein wondered which grades are affected at the moment and how many students are vaping in the school system. Ms. Styer said that it is a big problem at the high school, but they've also seen it in the middle schools, and have had a couple of incidents in the fifth grade at the elementary schools. She said that when the MetroWest health data is released on Friday, they will be able to show what it looks like, and how it grows throughout the grades. Mr. Epstein asked for the report to be distributed to the Committee when made available. Mr. Bell said that they recognize that the younger students

are impressionable, so part of the conversation they are having with older students, is how are they bringing the work and message they are doing to the younger grades. He added that something else to look at is how are we collecting data and how are we categorizing things; if we are not categorizing the same way, the data will be skewed. Ms. Hugo said that a few years ago there were public service announcements on tobacco use with pretty vivid graphic images, which reduced smoking for a while, and asked if something similar could be done for vaping, and what are the worst things that vaping causes? Dr. Wong said that nicotine usage on adolescent brains primes the brain to be more susceptible to addiction to other substances later in life. He added that parents should talk to kids about it without judgement, since it is an addiction, a neurological disease. Ms. Styer said that the most challenging part is the lack of understanding there is about how quickly someone can become addicted to nicotine using these devices: One expert said that addiction could start after three weeks of use, and vaping is so much easier to do and seems so harmless. Mr. Shah said that parents need to be more aware of that the devices come in different sizes and shapes. Mr. Finlay said there is a need to educate parents and students, and he would like to see health education classes and have it within the curriculum. He said that after the Student Advisory Committee's presentation, he thinks the Committee should work with administration to figure out a way for kids to feel safe in schools, including using the bathrooms, and work on enforcing the problem we are having. Ms. Bryant asked what the consequence is at the middle school level for a student who has a vaping device. Dr. Tremblay said it is in the handbook and language is made more clear within the high school handbook. He said that the worry is it being a punitive measure for someone who is struggling with addiction, as it is viewed as a health problem. Ms. Bryant asked about the frequency of vaping in the middle schools vs the high school, and if there is a policy or would one recommend the same techniques for both levels. Ms. Styer said it is a conduct issue so there is a need to have consequences, but at higher grades you will see more addiction, and we need to figure out how are we going to address that. Ms. Styer said that in addition to determining consequences, they are looking at second offenses being hooked up with a counselor or nurses for an assessment. Mr. Freudberg said that there has been a 78% increase in vaping in high schools nationally in recent years.

Elementary School Improvement Plans Votes and Handbook Vote

Assistant Superintendent for Elementary Education Amy Bright and Dr. Tremblay presented a performance report on the elementary schools and their progress on School Improvement Plans, as well as data showing progress. Dr. Tremblay said with iReady they now have empirical data that is predictive for MCAS, and can see how to adjust in real time, such as meeting with students and classrooms who are at a deficit. He said he visits a school almost every morning and starts those meetings off by talking about any problems or topics with the principals, such as staffing, budget conversations, anything that they need to discuss. He said he is then joined by senior leaders, or assistant superintendents, and they go over the student performance data, attendance data, and social emotional learning data. He said the last hour is experiencing it on the ground - visiting classrooms and observing how kids are learning. He said that this is a way to monitor investments, the use of technology, and how the technology is being used, or if it is being overused. The budget was built from firsthand experience and talking with principals, and how students are doing and how we know. The data in the reports shows that from fall to winter all schools have decreased the amount of students in Level 3 and increased the amount of students at Level 1.

Questions. Ms. Bryant asked how the amount of students in Level 3 in math can be addressed across the grades. Ms. Bright said this is the first year they are using this system in grades K-5 for the instructional path, and for ELL students they use Imagine Learning which is comparative. She said that they look at it from a curriculum lens on a regular basis, and last year it was tested on grades 3-5. She said this should be able to show where students are, and can help predict how they will do in the future. Mr. Epstein asked if the three times a year are sufficient enough to see growth. Dr. Tremblay said he believes so, and there are other ongoing formal assessments that teachers will do that will give them feedback in real time; any more assessments, coupled with MCAS would be too much. Mr. Epstein said once they are alerted a student is behind, what happens, and how are they able to identify an individual student that may be having trouble. Ms. Bright said i-Ready is used as a diagnostic, that gives an overview and starting point to have a conversation, which may then trigger a conversation to look at a student's scores on other assessments, and then lead to questions on why a student is achieving at that level - such as if it's due to being an online assessment, is the task not sufficient that's given in class, a look at the student's instructional path, and then determine the best way to teach the student. Ms. Bright said they look at individual kids through the data, and can see who is having trouble; they go over this with principals in the visits, along with the absenteeism list, as well. She added that this also helps with the relationship piece. She added that they also want to be able to talk about subgroups across schools, trends, and if our curriculum is matching the needs of those children. Dr. Tremblay said that previous to this, it was hard to see how schools were making progress and how money was being used as all schools as they were working autonomously. Ms. Bright said that teachers are still doing the work, the iReady is just an assessment in order to get a snapshot of where kids are in that moment. Ms. Hugo asked what role speed and agility of the students play in some of these scores, since they are on the computer. Ms. Bright said that last year they invested in iReady because it aligned with tools and functionality that they will see on an online test like MCAS. She said that additionally they purchased Type to Learn for all students in elementary school so they have time to practice typing skills and they are currently revisiting and reviewing the data to see if it's the best one for an intentional investment in a typing program. Mr. Epstein asked about the Portuguese Two-Way programs and if they will be increasing next year. Dr. Tremblay said they are looking to expand Spanish at Brophy Elementary and looking to expand Portuguese to Wilson; so four schools in the district would have dual language programs. Ms. Hugo said within the handbook most schools talked about kids riding bikes to school, but not all said helmets are necessary. She said that the handbook lists 5 absences as being the amount where a student can be withdrawn, but Mass General Law says ten days; are we allowed to make that distinction, she asked. She also asked if the numbers listed in case of a snow day or an emergency includes the Portuguese speaking station, and that the important phone numbers listed should include the Title IV Coordinator and the SAGE Program. Dr. Tremblay said Principal Rothwell put together this unified handbook, and that it is searchable and has hyperlinks to additional information. Dr. Tremblay said they are still working on adding the additional 15 minutes to the school schedule listed in the handbook that was added in the elementary school day, that was agreed upon in negotiations; this will have to be amended in the handbooks once it's decided if it's going to be at the beginning of the day or end, or splitting the difference. Mr. Freudberg, in a response to a request to clarify the motion, said in the future this handbook would not require a vote for each non-material amendment, and the Committee can just be informed.

Motion: To accept the Elementary School Improvement Plans and approve the handbooks with caveats that Chair mentioned.

Moved: Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Ms. Bryant **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Discussion: Ms. Bryant said Framingham's scores look good compared to national averages, but asked how are we doing compared to State scores. Ms. Bright said that MCAS will show this, but with iReady there is not a way to show the individual communities that use that assessment. Ms. Bryant asked for information regarding what makes up a responsive classroom. Ms. Bright said they are moving towards all 9 schools using responsive classrooms; which helps with social skills, zones of regulations and strategies. Ms. Bryant asked what strategies were being used to address absenteeism. Dr. Tremblay said they continue to reinforce the messaging of the importance of attendance in three languages, principals are encouraging that, and it is a matter of getting the messaging out that vacations should be taken during vacation times and not school days. Ms. Bryant said that a community member suggested letting parents know the consequences that could occur should they go over the amount of allowable absences. Dr. Tremblay said this is provided by principals on a case by case basis in order to work with families and try to find the root cause of the absences and how can we help; using the idea of engagement and to help kids feel involved, as well as figuring out how we can address them possibly feeling disenfranchised and not wanting to come to school. Ms. Bryant said she would encourage at least blanket messaging to show the need of attending - how it will help the child with regulation and education every year, even at the early years. Mr. Alexander asked what the requirements are for academic coaching. Ms. Bright said literacy and math coaches are interviewed, they have a specific job description, and they may not necessarily be the most senior person, but someone who has the qualifications, including licenses. She added that they receive additional trainings each month, and are creating a format for then training teachers with the same calibrated model across all nine schools. Mr. Alexander asked if there is data on communication between the schools and home, and requested some information on this as he thinks it is very integral to improve communication to parents. Dr. Tremblay said they can work on getting this data using the Blackboard system, but can only see if messaging has been sent and not if it has been read. Mr. Alexander asked if there was any feedback from parents on PBIS and Restorative Justice practices. Ms. Bright said that Responsive Classroom just started this year and is in the implementation process in some of the schools, at this point. She added that the Panorama Survey does give some data points, such as the connection students feel to the school and how safe the students feel in school.

Policy Subcommittee

Motion: To take as a consent agenda item all policies with changes to align with contract negotiations.

Moved: Ms. Bryant **Seconded:** Mr. Finlay All in agreement.

Motion: To approve policies GBD, GBE, GBH, GBI, GBJ, GBJA, GBJA-R, GBJA-E, GBCEAA, GCEB, GCF, GCI, GCJ, GCJA, GCL-R, GCO, GCQD, GCV/GDV, GDD, and GDO for first readings.

Moved: Ms. Bryant **Seconded:** Ms. Maskell **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Motion: To approve Policy BEDJA for a first reading.

Moved: Mr. Finlay **Seconded:** Ms. Hugo **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Motion: To refer a policy regarding the student activity account audit process to the Policy Subcommittee for formal action.

Moved: Mr. Finlay **Seconded:** Mr. Epstein **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Discussion: Ms. Hugo requested that this policy should include wording that the School Committee will meet with the auditor before and after the audit, as well as include district guidelines for raising and depositing funds.

Superintendent's Update

FY20 Dr. Tremblay gave an overview of the budget process and different percentages that were looked at as outlined in his memo, from the "all in" percentage of 12.69%, to his recommendation of 5.66%, to the 4.57% that the School Committee voted on and approved.. He said that the Mayor original gave an original proposal of a 2% increase but this has been increased to 3.1%, this does not close the gap but is an important increase. Dr. Tremblay said the District needs to honor what has been done in good faith with the unions and the FTA; he said he knows it's a big year for salary increases, but what comes along with that is a lot of things increased for kids and benefits for both sides of the table. He said that if we get too far below the proposed percentages that there will likely have to be prioritization reductions, which will likely impact personnel and operational expenses. He added that the operational expenses also includes stormwater management costs, transportation costs including homeless students, and a bunch of other unfunded mandates that had to be absorbed in the budget. Mr. Freudberg said the Committee already voted, but per the charter there is only one opportunity to submit the formal number, and that time and deadline has passed. But a committee can vote again as a resolution if they wish. Mayor Spicer said the most important part of a budget is the classroom teachers, and that is why she voted for the increase in Unit A negotiations. She added that she also has to look at what requirements are for the City; such as stormwater management, other fixed requirements, and what we need to maintain such as public safety. She said the schools receive approximately 46% of the current budget, and her team is looking at how they can better distribute funding to all departments and still maintain excellence. She said that the proposal is just a proposal, and conversations are still continuing; but she is deeply troubled to be categorized as not caring about education. Mr. Finlay said that we need to live within our means, and the City has been generous; we need to work with what can we survive on.

Motion: To send a non-binding resolution to the City Council for a 3.75% increase for the School Budget.

Moved: Mr. Finlay **Seconded:** Ms. Bryant

Discussion: Ms. Bryant said she would be satisfied if the District can get the elementary and middle schools programming funded. She said that if she could be assured that we will receive the 3.75%, she will respect that recommendation. She added that she would expect the City to give extra support should the need arise. Ms. Maskell said that we are not moving the needle ahead with a 3.75% increase; we are not getting the staff we need and she is not willing to compromise children's education. She added that the Committee did not vote for this number, they voted for 4.57%, which even then is less than the Superintendent's first recommendation. Mr. Epstein said that the process is clear; the Committee voted for the budget and then the process unfolds. He added that tonight that the Committee also does not have all the members who voted originally on the budget, and this would not be fair. He added that the City Council has the ability to increase the school budget as long as it doesn't go over the tax rate. Ms Hugo said this new budget request would be cutting it by 8.96% from where it started, and we still do not have details of what would be cut out if we went with the 3.75%. She said that with this, it looks like we would not be able to hire a lot of staff that are needed to raise the achievement

level, and we need to invest in the kids now; with an over 50% poverty rate and rated as a Level 3 district with the old DESE rating. She said that we do not know what amount of funds we will be getting from the state and federal at this point. Mr. Alexander said we should try to find a balance between not alienating taxpayers, but also advocating for the kids. Mr. Freudberg said this budget has realistic drivers - such as paying for extended time and adding a grade level at King. He would like to know if free cash has been looked at, why it can or cannot work, and what other options there are. Mr. Finlay said it would have been nice to have the City's CFO attend a meeting and explain the reasoning for the percentage they are giving. He added that he thinks the City should start with a zero-based budget, like the school district has. Ms. Bryant said that 12% should not be referred to as a starting point, as this was never a realistic number. Mr. Finlay said he **withdraws his motion** reluctantly but is listening to the full Committee.

FY19 Mr. Lynch said a question came up regarding the FY19 Year-to-Date Report on why some responsibility centers are at 50/60 percent. He said this was due to not encumbering salaries; everything that is showing as encumbered are expenses. He said that he will look at this for next year to see if he can change that. Mr. Lynch said that the **Food Service Negative Balance** has steadily declined over the past couple of reports, and has declined about \$2,000 from the start of the pilot program on March 1, 2019. He said that the response rate has not been great at all, but they do see the balances going down. Ms. Bryant asked how the problem with transportation has been going. Mr. Lynch said they're receiving a lot less calls and are working to split and double up runs to get students to school on time. He said that a data set was sent out to show the number of late busses and how it has decreased significantly. He said that they are in the middle of the Bell and Routing Study with the a routing software vendor and trying to create efficiencies for next year. Dr. Tremblay said he wanted to thank Resiliency for Life for sponsoring a training on calm and compassionate teaching for staff, which was a \$10,000 investment. Mr. Freudberg said that all of the School Improvement Plan updates will be complete after the next meeting, and going forward the Superintendent is proposing a student achievement update section as a recurring agenda item.

Subcommittee Reports

Finance and Operations. Mr. Epstein said that four warrants were signed. He said that the subcommittee met last week and discussed the Student Activity Account Audit, and they are looking to have a meeting with the auditor as a next step as there is a feeling that the audit was incomplete, had mistakes and did not comply to the DESE guidelines and needs to be redone. He said he would recommend that the Committee recommend to the City Council that they do not pay the auditor until it is a complete audit that everyone is satisfied with. Mr. Freudberg said the City Council Finance Subcommittee met today and voted to delegate to the Finance and Operations Subcommittee and full School Committee to take over the rest of the Student Activity Account Audit process.

Motion: The School Committee requests the City Council holds off payment to the auditor that is due for the Student Activity Account Audit for FY16, FY17 and FY18 until those audits are complete and acceptable to the School Committee.

Moved: Mr. Epstein **Seconded:** Ms. Hugo **Vote:** 5-2-0
(Yes: Hugo, Freudberg, Alexander, Epstein, Maskell. No: Finlay, Bryant)

Discussion: Mr. Finlay said he doesn't feel comfortable telling another body to not pay a bill which they contracted out for, and if a more in depth audit was wanted we could contract for

that and use money somehow in the budget. Mr. Freudberg said that he read the contract and the auditor is not following the contract. Mr. Epstein said it is a request, the Council can still go ahead and pay them, but he feels that once they are paid we lose leverage and the auditor can just walk away.

Approval of Grants/Gifts/Field Trips

Motion: To approve all the gifts and scholarships listed on the agenda.

Moved: Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Mr. Finlay **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Discussion: Ms. Hugo said that the second scholarship states that the donor will pick the recipient, and wants to know if there are guidelines in place regarding privacy and equity. She added that the Scholarship Committee was created to reduce inequities within scholarships. Mr. Lynch said that he can find out this information. Mr. Freudberg said that the School Committee's role with the agenda description tonight is to just approve the creation of the City accounts for the scholarships.

Motion: To accept the March 19, 2019 Joint Session and March 20, 2019 Open Session meeting minutes.

Moved: Ms. Bryant **Seconded:** Mr. Epstein **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Motion: To approve the Executive Session minutes from February 6, 2019 and February 27, 2019 as approved in Executive Session.

Moved: Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Mr. Alexander **Vote:** Unanimous (7-0-0)

Motion: To approve the Executive Session minutes from the previous School Committee from years 2015-2017 with various dates as approved in Executive Session to comply with the periodic review of redactions of the minutes.

Moved: Mr. Finlay **Seconded:** Ms. Maskell **Vote:** 6-0-1

(Yes: Hugo, Finlay, Freudberg, Alexander, Epstein, Maskell. Abstained: Bryant)

*Ms. Maskell and Mr. Finlay recused themselves

Motion: To approve the March 12, 2019 Executive Session minutes as approved in Executive Session.

Moved: Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Mr. Epstein **Vote:** Unanimous (5-0-0)

Adjournment

Motion: To adjourn.

Moved: Ms. Hugo **Seconded:** Mr. Epstein **Vote:** Unanimous (5-0-0)

Meeting adjourned at 10:54 p.m.

Meeting Materials

Agenda

City Pride Month Proclamation

The State of Vaping Presentation

Elementary School School Improvement Plans Presentation

i-Ready Fall to Winter District Data Update

Barbieri SIPS Update

Brophy SIPS Update

Dunning SIPS Update

Hemenway SIPS Update

Kings SIPS Update

McCarthy SIPS Update
Potter Road SIPS Update
Stapleton SIPS Update
Woodrow Wilson SIPS Update
Elementary School Collective Handbook
Policy Summary
First Reading of Policies Referred for Contract Alignment
First Reading of Policy BEDG
FY19 YTD Budget
FY19 Food Services Negative Balance
Pilot Program Food Services Update
Memo re: Gift from Exxon Mobil
Mark L and Eric R Cohn Scholarship
Ralph and Rosalie Kowalski Memorial Scholarship
Christopher Beatrice Memorial Scholarship
March 19, 2019 Joint Session Draft Minutes
March 20, 2019 Open Session Draft Minutes

These minutes were approved by the Framingham School Committee at the Open Session Meeting on June 5, 2019.

These minutes were sent to the City of Framingham for posting on June 7, 2019.